## GGINAL

.

: ; ;

į

i i

ļ

1	(CERTIFIED TAPE TRANSCRIPT)
2	
3	
4	MACRO INTERNATIONAL, INC.
5	
6	:
7	: .
8	FOCUS GROUP ON
9	: METHYL MERCURY :
10	: (FOOD AND DRUG ADMINISTRATION) :
11	:
12	:
13	
14	TUESDAY,
15	OCTOBER 17, 2000
16	8:00 P.M.
17	
18	Moderator: Lynn Halverson
19	
20	Denver, Colorado
21	
22	

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

1	P - R - O - C - E - E - D - I - N - G - S
2	MS. HALVERSON: I moderate for all
3	kinds of clients all over the country. The past
4	two days, we've been here in Denver talking with
5	consumers about how to communicate information
6	about health risks to consumers.
7	That's what we'll be talking about
8	today, generally, and I'll get into more
9	specifics later on. Because of the fact that I'm
10	an independent moderator, I have no vested
11	interest in any particular point of view, so I
12	hope everybody's just open and honest about what
13	they think about what we're talking about.
14	We don't have to come to any consensus.
15	There are no right or wrong answers. If Steven
16	says something, and Phyllis doesn't have the same
17	view, I want to hear both views and why, so we
18	can have a well rounded discussion here, and
19	understand where people are coming from.
20	This is part of a larger research
21	project, and I'm moderating groups all over, so
22	what I like to do is concentrate on what you

i

i

,

. . . . . . . . . .

•

1

i

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376 2

.

l

folks have to say while we're here.

To do that, I don't want to have to be 2 taking notes the whole time, so I've asked them 3 to tape this, and there's a microphone in the 4 5 ceiling. What that will require is for every 6 person to speak up just about as loudly as I am 7 now. Also, if you avoid side conversations with 8 your neighbor, that would be very helpful. 9 If that is going on, the tape picks 10 that up as well. It can't discriminate between 11 what I want to hear and what I don't want to 12 hear. A lot of times in a discussion, we'll have 13 14 two, three people talking at the same time. If that happens, I might have to play a 15 16 little traffic cop and take you one at a time, 17 because I want to make sure I capture what everybody has to say when it's on the tape. 18 19 I'm going to be using the tape to be 20 making a transcript of this group, and all it 21 will say is, the 8:00 p.m. group on October 17 in Denver, Colorado. 22

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

I won't identify anybody by name, so feel free to speak your mind, and no specific names will be on the tape at all. One other thing that I wanted to let you know is that I have some people who are very interested in what you have to say, that are with me here tonight.

7 They're in the room next door, so 8 they'll be listening in to what we are talking 9 about. Right before we're done, I'm going to run 10 back there and see if there's anything that I 11 should have asked you that I have forgotten to 12 ask, or if there's something they would like 13 clarified.

ł

ł

i

.

14 Those are our basic ground rules, 15 before we get started. Anybody have any 16 questions about the ground rules? All right, if 17 not, why don't we find out who we have around the 18 table. If you could just give me your first 19 name, and tell me how long you've been in the 20 Denver area.

21 A PARTICIPANT: My name is Bill. I've 22 been in the Denver area since '82. I went to

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

1 school in Gunnison, so I lived out there for 2 another two years. 3 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Where were you from originally? 4 A PARTICIPANT: 5 Iowa. 6 MS. HALVERSON: All right. A PARTICIPANT: I'm Susan. I've been 7 in Denver all my life. 8 All right. 9 MS. HALVERSON: 10 A PARTICIPANT: I'm Phyllis. I've been in Denver about 26 years. 11 12 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. And where did you come from, Phyllis? 13 A PARTICIPANT: Florida. 14 15 MS. HALVERSON: All right. A PARTICIPANT: I'm Susan. 16 I've been 17 here for about 25 years or so, originally from 18 Pittsburgh. 19 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Susan, if you 20 could speak up a little more, a little loudly. A PARTICIPANT: I have a bad throat 21 thing, but I'll do my best. 22

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

1 MS. HALVERSON: Oh, sorry. Okay. Ιn order to make sure we pick up everybody's voice 2 on the tape. All right. 3 4 A PARTICIPANT: I'm Michael. I've been in Denver for about 35 years. 5 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Great. 6 7 A PARTICIPANT: My name's Steve. I've been here about 29 years. 8 9 MS. HALVERSON: All right. A PARTICIPANT: 10 I'm Joanna, and I've 11 been here about 15 years. 12MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 13 A PARTICIPANT: I'm Steven, and I've 14been here about 36 years. MS. HALVERSON: 15 Okay. A PARTICIPANT: 16 I'm Donna, and I've been here since 1967. 17 18 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 19 A PARTICIPANT: But I was born and 20 raised in Colorado. 21 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 22 A PARTICIPANT: I'm Holly, and I've

6

1 only been here ten years.

i

MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 2 Well, I'm Lynn, and I've been here for 3 two days, now. What we're going to be talking 4 about today is conveying information about health 5 risks. 6 Before we do that, I want do some 7 introductory questions. First of all, regarding 8 fish or seafood, how many of you eat fish or 9 seafood as a regular part of your diet? 10 Almost everybody. Wow. Okay. About 11 12how often do you tend to eat it? A PARTICIPANT: Once a week. 13 A PARTICIPANT: Once a week. 1415 MS. HALVERSON: Once a week, maybe? Once or twice. 16 A PARTICIPANT: MS. HALVERSON: Once or twice? 17 18 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah, once or twice. 19 MS. HALVERSON: Anyone else? A PARTICIPANT: A couple times a month. 20 21MS. HALVERSON: Okay. A PARTICIPANT: About three times a 22

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

month. 1 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 2 A PARTICIPANT: Just a couple times a 3 month. 4 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. When you eat 5 fish, is it because you like it, or because 6 7 you've heard it's good for you? What are the major reasons? 8 A PARTICIPANT: I like it. 9 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 10 A PARTICIPANT: I love it. I'm an avid 11 fisherman, and I just --12 13 MS. HALVERSON: So you catch your own? A PARTICIPANT: Yeah. And I buy the 14saltwater kinds. 15 16 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Where do you catch it around here? 17A PARTICIPANT: Steamboat, mostly. 18MS. HALVERSON: Okay. What kinds of 1.9fish are you catching? 20 A PARTICIPANT: Trout, cochine (sp), 21 22 salmon.

l	MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Anyone else?
2	A PARTICIPANT: We do a lot of
3	grilling, on the grill, and my husband does
4	salmon, especially.
5	MS. HALVERSON: Um-hmm. Okay.
6	A PARTICIPANT: On the grill. It's
7	really good. Fresh trout is my favorite, but we
8	don't get that too often.
9	MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Anyone else?
10	Steve?
11	A PARTICIPANT: I like it. It's good
12	for you.
13	MS. HALVERSON: Okay.
14	A PARTICIPANT: Sort of a combination
15	of both.
16	MS. HALVERSON: Okay. What have you
17	have heard about fish that's good for you?
18	A PARTICIPANT: The oils.
19	MS. HALVERSON: The oils?
20	A PARTICIPANT: It's supposed to be
21	leaner, not as much fat.
22	MS. HALVERSON: Okay.

i.

į

-----

İ

A PARTICIPANT: Easier to digest. 1 MS. HALVERSON: Easier to digest 2 3 than --A PARTICIPANT: Then red meat. 4 MS. HALVERSON: All right. Anyone 5 else? How about disadvantages of fish? What 6 7 would be disadvantages, if any? A PARTICIPANT: I think the freshness, 8 that's a concern, and like what he has said, 9 freshness, that made me think of when I was 10 growing up, because we had it all the time. 11 Now you have to go buy it. We don't go 12 fishing. I'm concerned about the freshness. 13 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Let's talk a 14 little bit about possible environmental 15 contaminants that could get into the air that we 16 breathe, or the water that we drink, or the foods 17 that we eat. 18 19 When you think about contaminants, what kinds of things do you think about, either air, 20 water, or food? 21 22 A PARTICIPANT: Mercury.

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

l	MS. HALVERSON: Mercury? Why do you
2	say that?
3	A PARTICIPANT: It's been prevalent in
4	papers.
5	MS. HALVERSON: Okay.
6	A PARTICIPANT: It's been talked about.
7	MS. HALVERSON: And lead?
8	A PARTICIPANT: Car pollution.
9	MS. HALVERSON: Okay.
10	A PARTICIPANT: Chemicals, as far as
11	the sprays. Pesticides, and such things as that.
12	MS. HALVERSON: Okay.
13	A PARTICIPANT: Heavy metals and
14	radiation.
15	MS. HALVERSON: Okay.
16	A PARTICIPANT: Carbon monoxide in the
17	air, the brown cloud around Denver.
18	MS. HALVERSON: I noticed that when I
19	was flying in. Yeah.
20	A PARTICIPANT: Pesticides.
21	MS. HALVERSON: Pesticides? Okay.
22	When you think of pesticides as an environmental

ļ

1

:

Ì

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

contaminant, where do you think you, personally, 1 would be most likely to come into contact with a 2 contaminant like that? 3 A PARTICIPANT: Fruits and vegetables. 4 5 A PARTICIPANT: Fruits and vegetables. A PARTICIPANT: Fruits and vegetables. 6 7 MS. HALVERSON: All right. How about lead? 8 9 A PARTICIPANT: Water. MS. HALVERSON: Water? How does lead 10 11 get into water? Runoff. A PARTICIPANT: 1213 MS. HALVERSON: Runoff? A PARTICIPANT: 14 Pipes. MS. HALVERSON: 15 Pipes? A PARTICIPANT: Old pipes. 16 17 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. How about 18 mercury? 19 A PARTICIPANT: From fish. 20 MS. HALVERSON: From fish? Okay. What 21 kinds of fish would tend to have mercury more 22 than others? Any --

A PARTICIPANT: I would say ocean fish 1 more than fresh water. 2 MS. HALVERSON: Why would that be? 3 A PARTICIPANT: Because that's where . 4 all the water runs to. 5 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 6 A PARTICIPANT: Northern New Mexico is 7 pretty bad for it, too. The lakes and rivers. 8 9 MS. HALVERSON: And why does that occur, do you think? 10 A PARTICIPANT: Probably leaching from 11 the ground, I would imagine, from the soils. 12 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 13 A PARTICIPANT: Runoff from industry. 14 15 There's not that much industry down there. MS. HALVERSON: So how does mercury get 16 into fish? 17 18 A PARTICIPANT: Digest it. A PARTICIPANT: Digest it. 19 MS. HALVERSON: Digested? Holly, you 20 21 said - -A PARTICIPANT: Digest it. 22

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

MS. HALVERSON: From? 1 2 A PARTICIPANT: The water. MS. HALVERSON: 3 Okay. A PARTICIPANT: The foods that they 4 5 eat. MS. HALVERSON: Okay. What kind of 6 information do you, as a consumer, need to 7 protect yourself from these kinds of exposures, 8 like pesticides, and lead, mercury, kind of a 9 cumulative type of thing? 10A PARTICIPANT: I'd like to see --11 MS. HALVERSON: Susan, you're --12 13 A PARTICIPANT: Repeat that. 14 MS. HALVERSON: All right. 15 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah. 16 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. There are 17 certain kinds of contaminants that you get, like 18 pesticides, you would get a little bit at a time, 19 rather than, let's say, if I had an oil spill 20 into a lake, and that was where we got our 21 drinking water from. 22 That would be a major catastrophe. But

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

l pesticides are a little bit at a time. Mercury would be a little bit at a time in fish. 2 Lead. little bit at a time through your water. How do З 4 you find out about those kinds of contaminants? Does that make sense? 5 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah. 6 MS. HALVERSON: Do you have an answer? 7 A PARTICIPANT: No. 8 A PARTICIPANT: Usually hear about it 9 through the news. 10 MS, HALVERSON: Okay. 11 1.2A PARTICIPANT: It's released to the 13 news sources. MS. HALVERSON: Even the over-time 14 kinds of things? 15 Well, yeah, because, A PARTICIPANT: 16 I'm assuming scientists do studies. Food 17industries do studies. Government agencies do 18 studies. And then they release their findings to 19 20 the public. MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 21 A PARTICIPANT: I don't even know if 22

they need to release it. I think the media picks ٦ up on something, and it becomes overblown to the 2 extent that you panic, maybe more than you 3 should. 4 Joanne, what --5 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. oh, sorry. You had a question? 6 A PARTICIPANT: If you subscribe to a 7 health type magazine --8 A PARTICIPANT: An environmental 9 10 magazine. A PARTICIPANT: -- or environmental, 11 right. 12 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Health or 13 environmental magazines. All right. Joanne, 1.4 15 what kind of information would you like about contaminants such as these that you get in 16 smaller amounts? 17 A PARTICIPANT: Well, maybe how long it 18 would be before it would be, build up to where it 19 would be dangerous to a person. 20 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. All right. What 21 we're going to be looking at today is 22

i

ţ

1

į

ĺ

specifically information about mercury. What I'm going to do is show you three different examples of information.

We're going to look first of all at an opening paragraph, kind of introducing the subject, and then we're going to look at some information about that, that explains it and provides advice.

9 I have three different formats that I 10 want to show you, and what I'd like you to do is 11 to not look at how the information is laid out on 12 the page, obviously, because it's just in rough 13 form.

The type of information and the types of messages that are in the information that I'm going to provide: do they make their points clearly?

Can you understand what they're trying to say? Who's the target of this message? Is there enough detail? Is there too much detail? Those are the kinds of things I'd like us to focus on.

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

We're going to start out, first of all, 1 2 with example number five. Doesn't that sound logical? Out of three examples, we'll start with 3 number five. 4 5 As you can tell, we've had some other groups that have narrowed these down a little bit 6 7 on certain things. 8 A PARTICIPANT: I think we need one more down this way. 9 10 MS. HALVERSON: Need one more? Oh, got 11 it? Okay. I'll read this out loud, in case 12 anyone forgot their glasses. 13 "Fish is an important source of high 14 quality protein, vitamins, and minerals. Certain 15 fish species, however, are known to contain 16 higher levels of mercury than others. "Pregnant women, and women of child 17 18 bearing age are advised to eat a variety of seafood, and to avoid eating those species that 19 20 may contain higher levels of mercury. 21"These species are listed below." 22 Let's stay on page one. Sorry.

l

ł

A PARTICIPANT: I'm looking for the 1 examples. 2 MS. HALVERSON: I know. There are the 3 examples, but let's stay on page one just to 4 begin. So, when you read this opening paragraph, 5 does it do a good job of describing for you the 6 hazard for mercury? 7 A PARTICIPANT: No. 8 A PARTICIPANT: No. 9 A PARTICIPANT: No. 10 MS. HALVERSON: No? Why not? Susan, 11 or Donna? 12 A PARTICIPANT: I'm sorry. 13 MS. HALVERSON: It's quite all right. 14Donna, go ahead. 15 A PARTICIPANT: It's telling us there's 16 a danger, but it's not really saying how much of 17 a danger. 18 A PARTICIPANT: Or why there's a 19 danger. 20 A PARTICIPANT: Right. And they're 21 just saying pregnant women and women of child 22

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

٦ bearing age. Why not everybody else? MS. HALVERSON: Okav. 2 A PARTICIPANT: I realize there's more 3 4 of a danger to them, but --5 A PARTICIPANT: What kind of fish are they talking about, I guess. Does shark have a 6 7 lot of mercury, or does dolphin have, or trout? I'm not much of a fisherman. 8 9 MS. HALVERSON: These species will be listed below. 1.0 A PARTICIPANT: Well, I don't see that 11 12 either, so --MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Don't worry. 13 I've got it on page two. Susan, do you want to 14 comment? 15 16 A PARTICIPANT: Well, I was just 17 noticing, it says, some could contain higher 18 levels of mercury, but it doesn't go into, at 19 all, why that's bad. 20MS. HALVERSON: Um-hmm. A PARTICIPANT: What if I don't know 21 22 that mercury is bad, and I'm wondering what it is

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

į

1	about mercury that I need to avoid.
2	MS. HALVERSON: Ah, okay.
3	A PARTICIPANT: Why is it bad? What's
4	it going to do?
5	MS. HALVERSON: Is there anything else
6	that's confusing about this introduction?
7	A PARTICIPANT: Does it affect us at
8	all, men?
9	MS. HALVERSON: Okay.
10	A PARTICIPANT: Or is it just
11	A PARTICIPANT: What about me?
12	A PARTICIPANT: Yeah.
13	MS. HALVERSON: Okay.
14	A PARTICIPANT: Can men eat as much as
15	we want?
16	MS. HALVERSON: All right. Any other
17	confusing things about this paragraph?
18	A PARTICIPANT: To me it's not really
19	cohesive. It says, high quality of protein, and
20	then it drops immediately into the dangers of
21	mercury.
22	MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Let's go on,

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

i

Bill wanted to know what these species 1 then. listed below are, and here they are. 2 3 "FDA warns consumers who are pregnant, thinking of becoming pregnant in the next six 4 months, nursing a baby, choose the fish you eat 5 6 carefully. "Four types of fish contain high levels 7 of methyl mercury residue that can harm 8 developing fetuses and nursing babies. 9 The methyl mercury can accumulate in your body, so it 10 is important to limit the amount you eat. 11 "Be aware of these four fish." And 12 13 then it has, "Limit what you eat. Mackerel: do not eat. Shark: do not eat. Sword fish: do not 14 eat. Tuna: fresh or frozen, three times a month. 15 16 Canned, four three-ounce servings a week. "All other types of fish are safe to 17 eat, such as shellfish, halibut, or processed 18 fish. such as fish sticks." 19 Okay. What is the most important point 20 you take from this particular piece of advice? 21 A PARTICIPANT: What not to eat. 22

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

1	MS. HALVERSON: Okay.
2	A PARTICIPANT: Definitely do not eat
3	mackerel, shark, or sword fish.
4	A PARTICIPANT: In bold letters, do not
5	eat.
6	MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Does this
7	handout do a good job at explaining who should be
8	worried about mercury?
9	A PARTICIPANT: Yes.
10	A PARTICIPANT: Um-hmm.
11	A PARTICIPANT: Yes.
12	MS. HALVERSON: Okay, and who do they
13	say should be worried about it?
14	A PARTICIPANT: Pregnant women.
15	A PARTICIPANT: Or people thinking
16	about becoming pregnant.
17	A PARTICIPANT: Or nursing moms.
18	MS. HALVERSON: All right. Now, Steve
19	asked a question earlier: "What about the rest of
20	us, like men?"
21	A PARTICIPANT: Well, what about women?
22	A PARTICIPANT: It still doesn't answer

.

. . . . . .

i i

1 that, because it says it accumulates in your body, so I'd assume I don't want all that 2 accumulating in my body. 3 MS. HALVERSON: 4 Okay. 5 A PARTICIPANT: Why is it harmful to babies, and not harmful to adults? 6 7 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. A PARTICIPANT: Or other children. 8 9 A PARTICIPANT: Right. 10 MS. HALVERSON: Okay, so it isn't answering that question for you? 11 12 A PARTICIPANT: Right. 13 A PARTICIPANT: Nο MS. HALVERSON: All right. So, let's 14 say you read this sheet of information that had 15 the introductory paragraph and this. Steve, what 16 17 kind of response would you have then? Would it affect the way you would look at eating fish? 18 19 A PARTICIPANT: I don't know, I really 20 like shark and sword fish already, so now I'm 21 wondering, would it be better not to eat it? This still sort of one answer. Would you be 2.2

Í

healthier if you don't eat it? 1 MS. HALVERSON: 2 Michael? A PARTICIPANT: This is telling me that 3 I'm going to go home and boot up the computer 4 5 when we get out of here. MS. HALVERSON: Okay. All right. 6 A PARTICIPANT: It wouldn't bother me 7 8 in the slightest, because it looks like it's 9 talking more to women than men. MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Donna, you're a 10 11woman. 12 A PARTICIPANT: I was going to say, I don't understand -- okay, I understand when 13 you're pregnant or thinking of becoming pregnant, 14 15 or nursing, you do have to be more careful about certain things, but if this can happen to babies, 16 17 then there's got to be a danger to just the average person, I would think. 18 A PARTICIPANT: For every person. 19 A PARTICIPANT: Why does it just build 20 up in their body and nobody else's? 21 22 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Susan, did

i

ì

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

1 you --

i

|

ł

I.

÷

:

i

2	A PARTICIPANT: That's exactly my
3	thought. I wouldn't touch it either. Just
4	because the warning goes out to pregnant,
5	nursing, and babies, I think that's a warning to
6	everyone, to me. That's how I take things like
7	that. I think I'll just avoid it.
8	A PARTICIPANT: My question would be,
9	how does it harm developing fetuses and nursing
10	babies? In what way are they harmed by this?
11	A PARTICIPANT: I would want to know
12	that.
13	MS. HALVERSON: Any other questions it
14	raises for you?
15	A PARTICIPANT: I eat a lot of tuna. I
16	know it says nursing babies, but I agree, if it's
17	affecting them, it might be affecting me, and I
18	just don't know it, because I have other allergy
19	reactions to fish anyway, so I kind of watch
20	that.
21	MS. HALVERSON: Ah, okay.
22	A PARTICIPANT: But I know when I eat

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

fish, I usually have to suffer the consequences. 1 2 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. How about that tuna issues? Canned tuna. 3 Pregnant women or those nursing babies could eat four three-ounce 4 5 servings a week. What does that say to you? A PARTICIPANT: It's processed. 6 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah, they're getting 7 8 processed. 9 A PARTICIPANT: Why is the fresh worse? 10What do they do to it? 11 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. A PARTICIPANT: That the canned is 12okay? 13 MS. HALVERSON: Would that affect how 14 much tuna you would eat at all, the fact that 15 they're putting that on there? 16 17 A PARTICIPANT: Probably not. 18 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 19 A PARTICIPANT: I'm sorry, but yeah, I 20 mean, we don't eat fresh or frozen tuna that 21 often, but canned tuna, we do quite a bit. 22 A PARTICIPANT: So it's got to be the

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

1 way they process it, to eliminate the mercury, to make it less. 2 MS. HALVERSON: How are the risky kinds 3 of fish specified on this particular chart? 4 A PARTICIPANT: Don't eat. 5 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. How would you 6 7 classify tuna? As a risky fish, or not a risky fish? 8 A PARTICIPANT: It goes from very risky 9 10 down to not so risky. A PARTICIPANT: Not so bad. 11 12 A PARTICIPANT: And why is it just these fish? What about the others? 13 A PARTICIPANT: You know, they are 14 15 where they're at. 16 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 17 A PARTICIPANT: I would want to know, why aren't they affected. 18 Okay, let's imagine 19 MS. HALVERSON: 20 that we're all pregnant women around here, and we get this information from our doctors. So, we're 21 22 trying to decide what to eat. How would you

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

interpret this information if you were a pregnant 1 2 woman? A PARTICIPANT: I wouldn't eat it. 3 A PARTICIPANT: I wouldn't eat it. 4 5 MS. HALVERSON: How about the tuna 6 fish? A PARTICIPANT: 7 Wouldn't eat it. MS. HALVERSON: Why not? 8 9 A PARTICIPANT: Might eat the canned. Little bit. A PARTICIPANT: 10 11 A PARTICIPANT: Don't take any chances. 12A PARTICIPANT: There's too much other stuff to eat for nine months. I'd survive 13 without my canned tuna for nine months. 14 A PARTICIPANT: 15 Yeah. 16 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Holly? 17 A PARTICIPANT: I agree. I wouldn't 18 eat any of it. 19 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. How about the stuff on the bottom, where it says, "All other 20 types of fish are safe to eat, such as shellfish, 21 22 halibut, or processed fish such as fish sticks."

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

1 A PARTICIPANT: It's a good excuse to 2 eat shrimp. 3 MS. HALVERSON: Okay, so you are saying you wouldn't eat any of these that are listed up 4 5 here --A PARTICIPANT: Huh-uh. 6 MS. HALVERSON: -- but you would eat 7 the other kinds of fish, or shellfish. 8 9 A PARTICIPANT: I would question it, because halibut --10 11 A PARTICIPANT: There's no number on 12 these things. To me, it's either an all or none 13 type thing. 14 A PARTICIPANT: Maybe if it was in a chart form, where all the different types of 15 1.6 seafood were listed, and what the risks were. 17 A PARTICIPANT: Personally --18 A PARTICIPANT: But even then, if was 19 pregnant, I would probably eat seafood in 20 definite moderation. 21 A PARTICIPANT: Um-hmm. 22 A PARTICIPANT: Just try to avoid it in

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

1 general, I guess. MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Joanna? 2 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah, I would avoid it 3 4 for the nine months. MS. HALVERSON: All seafood, or just 5 the ones listed? 6 7 A PARTICIPANT: Definitely the ones listed. 8 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Does that 9 include tuna fish, or not, for you? 10 A PARTICIPANT: Yes, that would include 11 12 tuna fish, and that's normally what I eat, mostly 13 canned tuna. 14MS. HALVERSON: Okay. And why would you cut that out? 15 16 A PARTICIPANT: Because, like what she 17 said. For nine months, I can go without anything that doesn't seem healthy. 18 19 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. All right. Let's set this one aside, and I have another one 20 21 that I'm going to be sending out. For our second 22 example, I have "Example Three," to keep up with

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

1 our numbering scheme, here.

2	This one says, "A recent report from
3	the National Academy of Sciences looked at the
4	evidence that mercury can cause learning problems
5	in children exposed to high levels of mercury in
6	the mother's diet during pregnancy.
7	"Since fish are the main source of
8	dietary exposure to mercury, the EPA and FDA are
9	providing guidelines about the kinds and amount
10	of fish that pregnant and nursing mothers, and
11	women of child bearing age, can safely eat
12	without exposing their children to any
13	significant risk of harm.
14	Okay. When you read that introductory
15	paragraph, and let's just try and forget the
16	other one for a little bit here, does this do a
17	good job of describing the hazard of mercury to
18	you?
19	A PARTICIPANT: Yes.
20	A PARTICIPANT: Yes.
21	MS. HALVERSON: Okay, what is it about
22	this one that does? Holly?

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

A PARTICIPANT: Well, it says that it 1 can cause learning problems, and that's what my 2 question was on the first one. How is it 3 harmful. and what are the results of that? 4 MS. HALVERSON: Okav. 5 A PARTICIPANT: And I think it's, since 6 the report came from the National Academy of 7 Sciences, to me, that sounds like something I 8 would believe or listen to, more than this. This 9 doesn't say where they got this from. 10 11 MS. HALVERSON: Okav. A PARTICIPANT: Whereas this would make 12 me tend to believe it more. 13 A PARTICIPANT: Awfully wordy though. 14 A PARTICIPANT: But they explain it 15 They say where the mercury comes from in well. 16 17 larger quantities, they say what the problems are, and it explains who should be careful. 18 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Would this kind 19 20of introduction help you understand who should pay attention to the advice that's going to be 21 given, and why? 22

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

A PARTICIPANT: More, ves. 1 2 A PARTICIPANT: Yes. 3 MS. HALVERSON: Okay, and why would that be? 4 5 A PARTICIPANT: Because it talks about the learning problems in children that is the 6 result of the mother's diet during pregnancy. 7 8 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Is there anything about this particular introduction that 9 is confusing to you? 10 A PARTICIPANT: 11 No. A PARTICIPANT: Uh-uh. 12 13 A PARTICIPANT: No. MS. HALVERSON: Nothing? 14Joanna? 15 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah, the first 16 sentence, the wording on it is very different. "A report looked at the evidence that mercury can 17 18 cause learning problems in children exposed to 19 high levels of mercury in the mother's diet 20 during pregnancy." 21 Those are huge, to keep track of that 22 all the way through, for the average person.

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 1 A PARTICIPANT: That would be a lot. 2 A PARTICIPANT: If you ate too much 3 4 mercury, you couldn't follow that. MS. HALVERSON: Mike, did you have a 5 б comment? A PARTICIPANT: No. I agree with what 7 people are saying. 8 9 MS. HALVERSON: Okav. A PARTICIPANT: I do like the fact that 10 it says fish are the main source of dietary 11 12 exposure to mercury. MS. HALVERSON: Okay. So that 13 14 clarifies something that wasn't clarified in the earlier one. 15 16 A PARTICIPANT: But it still raises the 17 question, does it affect, at all, learning abilities in adults? Does it have zero? 18 19 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 20 A PARTICIPANT: That's what I would 21 still be wondering. 22 A PARTICIPANT: Okay.

A PARTICIPANT: That would be my 1 question too. What happens while you're pregnant 2 could affect the kid, but what happens if you're 3 six years old and eat a lot of fish. That could 4 cause, possibly, learning problems, for adults 5 6 too. A PARTICIPANT: Right. 7 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Let's go ahead 8 and turn to the second page, here. "What kind of 9 fish should I eat? 10"Women who are, or may become pregnant 11 within six months, and nursing mothers, should 12 consume types of fish known to have low levels of 13 mercury (see Table 1) and should avoid fish known 14 to have high mercury levels (see Table 2). 15 "The fish in Table 1 can generally be 16 eaten a total of two to three times per week 17 without concern for adverse effects from mercury, 18 with each meal size being six ounces of cooked 19 fish, or eight ounces of uncooked fish. 20"Breaded fish sticks, fish sandwiches, 21and imitation crab meat are generally made from 22

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

these fish, and so usually have low levels of 1 2 mercury." And then, "Table 1: Fish and Seafood 3 4 that are generally low in mercury. May be consumed a total of two to three times per week, 5 6 by pregnant and nursing women." 7 It has three columns of all kinds of 8 fish. "What fish should I avoid? The fish in 9 10 Table 2 are known to have high levels of mercury, and should be avoided by women who are, or may 11 12become pregnant within the next six months, and 13 nursing mothers. 14 "Table 2: Fish and seafood that are generally high in mercury. Should be avoided by 15 16 pregnant and nursing women. King mackerel, 17 shark, sword fish, tile (sp) fish (or ocean white fish). 18 "What about tuna? For canned tuna, 19 20 which is the most frequently consumed purchased 21 fish, a total of two to three, three-ounce cans 22 may be consumed per week.

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

İ

"What about fish not on the lists? For 1 2 all other fish and seafood not mentioned, consumption should be limited to one meal per 3 week, six ounces cooked, eight ounces uncooked. 4 5 by women who are, or may become pregnant within six months, and nursing mothers. 6 "This applies to fish bought in a store 7 or restaurant, and to all fresh water fish caught 8 9 by you or your family in local waters." When you read that advice, what Okay. 10 is the most important point taken from this 11 particular piece of advice? 1.2 It's definitely saying 13 A PARTICIPANT: pregnant women shouldn't, or even if you think 14 you might become pregnant, which tends to make me 15 think it's going to stay in your body for awhile. 16 17 A PARTICIPANT: Um-hmm. 18 A PARTICIPANT: Right. But why just women? 19 A PARTICIPANT: MS. HALVERSON: 20 Okay. 21A PARTICIPANT: Yeah, it gives you a 22 good list of fish to choose from, you know,

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

should you want to consume them, and you're 1 2 pregnant. MS. HALVERSON: Okav. 3 A PARTICIPANT: But it's also saying 4 all seafood has some sort of mercury in it. 5 Yeah, yeah. A PARTICIPANT: 6 A PARTICIPANT: That you should limit 7 the amount that you eat. 8 A PARTICIPANT: Just don't worry about 9 the four. All fish have some mercury available 10 to it. 11 12 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. A PARTICIPANT: I think it's hard to 13 read and understand, but I do think it's written 14 more in a medical, you'd find this more in a 15 medical journal as opposed to giving it to a 16 17 consumer. MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Does this 18 handout do a good job at explaining who should be 19 worried about mercury? 20 A PARTICIPANT: Yes. 21 22 A PARTICIPANT: Absolutely.

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 1 A PARTICIPANT: Assuming those are the 2 only categories at risk. 3 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Assuming that. 4 A PARTICIPANT: Yes. 5 MS. HALVERSON: It sounds like there's 6 7 still question around the table about that. A PARTICIPANT: Um-hmm. 8 MS. HALVERSON: What is distinctive 9 about this approach compared to the last one? 10 11 A PARTICIPANT: Well, it tells you a list of what is okay to eat, and not just what 12you shouldn't eat. 13 14 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. A PARTICIPANT: For me, listing this 15 many is a little more believable than just 16 17 listing a few species. MS. HALVERSON: 18 Okay. A PARTICIPANT: Plus, I like that it 19 20 lists, it says something about the foods not on the list, in case there's something you're 21 thinking about eating, and it's not on there. 22

i

ļ

41111

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

1 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. A PARTICIPANT: It gives you the 2 quidelines for that. 3 MS. HALVERSON: Michael, you want to 4 5 comment? A PARTICIPANT: 6 Yeah. This explains 7 why instead of saying just don't do it. MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 8 9 A PARTICIPANT: So it's a little more informative. 10 11 A PARTICIPANT: It's more comforting. 12 A PARTICIPANT: It gives information 13 though, that's not, for canned tuna, which is the 14 most frequently consumed purchased fish -- I mean, it's so wordy. 15 16 It uses too many words if you were 17 going to be, like we said, giving it to a consumer group. Some information doesn't need to 18 be -- I don't know. It's very wordy to me. 19 20 A PARTICIPANT: I'm kind of confused to 21 me. It says white fish up there, and mackerel, 22 Atlantic; then another paragraph says king

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

mackerel, tile fish is ocean white fish. What's 1 the difference? I guess I wouldn't know. 2 A PARTICIPANT: White fish is white 3 fish. 4 A PARTICIPANT: Ocean white fish 5 compared to white fish. What's the difference? 6 A PARTICIPANT: I wouldn't know. 7 8 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. A PARTICIPANT: That kind of gets me, 9 because I don't fish that well myself. 10 MS. HALVERSON: So how does this 11 particular sheet, then, indicate to you which 12 fish are the risky fish? 13 A PARTICIPANT: Must be sole, because 14 it's on there twice. 15 A PARTICIPANT: Sure it. 16 A PARTICIPANT: Any kind of sole. 17 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. How do you tell 18 which ones are the risky fish on this. 19 A PARTICIPANT: By looking at Table 2. 20 A PARTICIPANT: By Table 2, yeah. 21 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. How would you 22

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

categorize Table 1, then? 1 A PARTICIPANT: It's the hallelujah 2 table. 3 A PARTICIPANT: I'd say those are the. 4 most common fish that are eaten from the sea. 5 6 A PARTICIPANT: You know, if you really liked fish, you'd probably still go to Table 1 7 for something that you could eat. If you didn't 8 care that much, you'd probably just dismiss all 9 of them, and just figure, forget it, I'm not 10 going to go find the name, because I don't go for 11 fish that much anyway. 12 13 MS. HALVERSON: Okav. 14 A PARTICIPANT: Just not eat it. 15 A PARTICIPANT: But you're not 16 pregnant, either. 17 A PARTICIPANT: Well, that's true. Ιf 18 I were, I'd have other things to worry about. 19 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. How about our 2.0Table 2, we decided are the ones that are the 21riskiest fish, and Table 1, Mike called the 22 hallelujah table, so how would the rest of you

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

categorize Table 1? 1 A PARTICIPANT: It would be a safer 2 selection. 3 MS. HALVERSON: Safer? Okav. 4 5 A PARTICIPANT: Lower risk. MS. HALVERSON: Lower risk. All right. 6 How about tuna? Where would you put that in 7 terms of safer or riskier? 8 9 A PARTICIPANT: They're saying you can't eat it but two to three times a week, 10 certain amounts, so I would put it in Table 1. 11 A PARTICIPANT: But they didn't --12 A PARTICIPANT: Which I don't 13 understand, why it's not in Table 1. 14A PARTICIPANT: Yeah. 15A PARTICIPANT: Well, they didn't put 16 in Table 2 that it is a risk. Or is that 17 considered ocean white fish? 18 (Simultaneous discussion.) 19 A PARTICIPANT: In Table 1 you can eat 20 21 six ounces of cooked fish or eight ounces of uncooked fish. But tuna, you can only eat three 22

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

ounces at a time. So you can only eat half as 1 2 much. 3 A PARTICIPANT: But I just wonder why it's separated. 4 A PARTICIPANT: 5 Yeah. 6 A PARTICIPANT: Why it asks the 7 question about tuna. 8 A PARTICIPANT: Why isn't it just on 9 the list with the other foods? A PARTICIPANT: Maybe that's because 10 it's most frequently consumed. 11 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah. 12A PARTICIPANT: It probably is, and 13 14 because it's been pulled out, it draws my attention more to it as to, oh, there's something 15 16 more about tuna than these other fish. 17 A PARTICIPANT: If I was presenting this, I think I would put the most toxic ones 1819 first, then the more acceptable ones, and then put tuna. 20 21MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Where would you put that last category, then, about fish now on 22

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

1 the lists? 2 A PARTICIPANT: I'd put it at the 3 bottom. A PARTICIPANT: At the bottom. 4 5 A PARTICIPANT: At the bottom. Yeah. 6 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. At the bottom. 7 Are you saying that they are less toxic than --8 what are you saying about them? 9 A PARTICIPANT: Just saying --10 A PARTICIPANT: They're safe. 11 A PARTICIPANT: -- if you can't find it 12 above, then this is what it was. 13 MS. HALVERSON: Okav. 14 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah, I'd say if 15 they're not on the Table 2, then probably they're going to be okay. I hope. 16 17 A PARTICIPANT: But if you're in the 18 fish industry, or whatever, you're going to want 19 to put the fish that people can eat first. 20 A PARTICIPANT: Because you wouldn't 21 want to scare them. 22 A PARTICIPANT: Well, so, look at all

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

the choices you have. These are only four fish you can't eat. We have two dozen fish that you can eat. A more positive spin.

MS. HALVERSON: Okay. How about this 4 5 "fish not on the list" though? It says, "For all 6 fish and seafood not mentioned, consumption should be limited to one meal per week by women 7 who are or may become pregnant" as opposed to the 8 two to three times per week in Table 1. Why do 9 you think they're saying that? 10 A PARTICIPANT: 11 That would say to me 12 that anything that's not on the top list is 13 slightly higher in mercury. 14 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. A PARTICIPANT: But not as high as 15 16 Table 2. 17 A PARTICIPANT: Fish are still of a 18 concern, but just be careful of what you are 19 eating. 20 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah. Use moderation. 21 A PARTICIPANT: I think it's kind of

22 misleading when you look at it closely.

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

A PARTICIPANT: Yeah. 1. A PARTICIPANT: Because they suggest 2 these only once a week, but Table 1, you can go 3 two to three times a week. 4 A PARTICIPANT: Right. 5 6 A PARTICIPANT: So I've been not reading real closely and thinking these other are 7 a lesser risk than the first table. 8 9 MS. HALVERSON: Than Table 1? Ah. A PARTICIPANT: But that's not what it 10 says, when you really read it. 11 A PARTICIPANT: No, it's not. 12MS. HALVERSON: Okay. It says, "This 13 applies to fish bought in a store or restaurant 14and to all fresh water fish caught by you or your 15 16 family in local waters." 17 How much mercury, then, how do you 18 decide --19 A PARTICIPANT: They can't make that statement about your local water. 20 A PARTICIPANT: How much mercury there 21 22 is --

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

MS. HALVERSON: Okay. l A PARTICIPANT: They don't have a clue. 2 A PARTICIPANT: I'm curious why you can 3 eat more if it's uncooked than if it's cooked. 4 You'd think if you would cook it, it would be a 5 little safer. 6 7 A PARTICIPANT: Huh. A PARTICIPANT: But it does say that 8 you can only do six ounces cooked, eight ounces 9 10 uncooked. A PARTICIPANT: Um-hmm. 11 A PARTICIPANT: I think they mean by 12 13 weight. A PARTICIPANT: Weight. 14 A PARTICIPANT: Oh, after you cook it. 15 MS. HALVERSON: Okay, let's put Michael 16 17 on the spot. He's our fisherman in the group. You're out catching -- what are you going to 18 catch for us? 19 20 A PARTICIPANT: Oh, I don't know, probably just go for trout today. 21 MS. HALVERSON: Go for trout. Okay. 22

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

A PARTICIPANT: 1 Yeah. 2 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. So we're going to have a trout dinner that Michael caught for 3 4 us. Then there's a plate of herring. Mγ 5 relatives are from Norway, so we have herring over here. That's on Table 1. 6 How do we decide which has more 7 mercury? A commercially caught herring, or 8 Mike's fresh caught fish? 9 10 A PARTICIPANT: Going by this? 11 MS. HALVERSON: Um-hmm. 12 A PARTICIPANT: It would be my fresh caught fish that would have the more mercury. 13 14 A PARTICIPANT: Right. MS. HALVERSON: 15 Okay. And what's your 16 gut feeling? 17 A PARTICIPANT: I'd eat it anyway. MS. HALVERSON: But in terms of 18 mercury. Do you feel like the fish that you 19 20 catch is going to have more, or less, mercury per 21 portion? 22 A PARTICIPANT: I don't how it would.

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

1 A PARTICIPANT: It would depend on the 2 area that you're from, I would think, too, the З locale. 4 A PARTICIPANT: Without the list. I don't know, I'd tend to go for the fresh caught 5 trout, just because, especially if you're in 6 7 Colorado, you think there's going to be less of that than something they're catching off the East 8 9 coast, you know. 10 MS. HALVERSON: Hey, watch that East 11 coast stuff. MS. HALVERSON: All right. So your gut 1213 feeling would be that trout caught in your beautiful streams here in Colorado would be safe? 14 15 A PARTICIPANT: Sure, if you want to 16 look at some type of woods. 17 MS. HALVERSON: Okay, and how about you 18 go to the store and you buy commercially caught fish, versus the fresh caught trout, in general? 19 20 A PARTICIPANT: I think I would feel 21 safer about the fresh caught. 22 MS. HALVERSON: Because?

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

A PARTICIPANT: Well, for one thing, it 1 definitely tastes better. The fresher it is, the 2 better it tastes. So I'm assuming from that, 3 it's better, but I guess not necessarily so. 4 5 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Now I live in 6 Maryland. If I catch fish out there, would you feel safer with my fresh caught fish in Maryland, 7 or commercial fish you could buy in my store? 8 A PARTICIPANT: I've seen the water in 9 Maryland. 10 A PARTICIPANT: When I was stationed 11 there, I fished there all the time. 12 MS. HALVERSON: Really? Okay. 13 A PARTICIPANT: I love to fish. 14 A PARTICIPANT: I'd eat some crab if I 15 16 was out there. 17 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. A PARTICIPANT: If it's farm raised 18 19 fish, it's going to be more what the fish is consumed, so my tendency would be, yeah, if I 20 caught the fish and knew where it came from, 21 22 yeah, I'd want the fresh fish. But otherwise,

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

it's still probably coming from some sort of a 1 factory raised something or another. 2 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. All right. З Let's see. So, again, we're going to be our 4 pregnant women looking at this list, and we have 5 to decide what we're going to eat, what we're not 6 going to eat. Bill, during your pregnancy, what 7 are you going to eat? 8 A PARTICIPANT: Shrimp. 9 MS. HALVERSON: Shrimp? Okay. Steve? 10A PARTICIPANT: Oh, anything off of 11 Table 1. 12MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Susan? What are 13 you going to eat? 14 A PARTICIPANT: You know, I would still 15 be cautious. When I was pregnant I was that way. 16 I just stayed away from any possible problems. 17 So I would probably treat myself to lobster once 18 while I was pregnant if I was really dying for 19 seafood. 20 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 21 A PARTICIPANT: Otherwise, I'd avoid 22

į

i

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

1 it. MS. HALVERSON: Phyllis, how about you? 2 A PARTICIPANT: I'd probably just stick 3 to canned tuna. 4 MS. HALVERSON: All right. Susan? 5 A PARTICIPANT: If I'm looking at this, 6 I may just, because it says you can consume it 7 two or three times a week, I'd probably would 8 maybe once a month from Table 1. 9 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Now, I'm sensing 10 something here. Our pregnant men --11 MS. HALVERSON: -- are saying, this is 12 what I seem to be hearing. You guys seem to be 13 saying, okay, look at this. The chart says I can 14 eat this, I'll eat that. 15 The pregnant women, I'm hearing saying, 16 I'm probably going to interpret it more 17 cautiously than they tell me. Is that correct? 18A PARTICIPANT: Yeah, I feel that way. 19 20I don't know, if you just eat it a few times, it's what it says there. I don't know what kind 21 of effects it's going to have, really, on a guy. 22

i

÷.

Í

ļ

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

A PARTICIPANT: I figure meat's bad for 1 you too, and if you overdo it, there's something 2 wrong with it and it's not good for you, so as 3 long as you stay within the limits, and I like . 4 5 fish a lot, so --6 A PARTICIPANT: I think also women are 7 bombarded when they're pregnant or thinking about being pregnant, about all of the terrible things 8 that can happen to the fetus. Men probably don't 9 get bombarded that much. 10 11 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Donna? 12 A PARTICIPANT: You know, I think I still would eat the fish in moderation, you know. 13 14 I wouldn't, after seeing this, definitely not eat 15 any of the ones on Table 2, but the others, I would, but just not go overboard, just like you 16 wouldn't anything else. 17 18 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Now let me ask 19 When you look at Table 1 and it lists out you. 20 something like 24 different kinds of fish, and it 21 says, "generally low in mercury, may be consumed

22 two to three times per week; " and you look at

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

Table 1 and it doesn't list all those out, are 1 you more, or less, likely to eat something that's 2 listed specifically, or that just says, if it's 3 in this category it's probably okay? 4 A PARTICIPANT: I like the specifics. 5 MS. HALVERSON: You like having it 6 listed out specifically? 7 A PARTICIPANT: So I can look at it, 8 and say, yes, it's listed there, it's probably 9 okay. 10 MS. HALVERSON: Holly, I'm taking you 11 out to dinner, and they have your favorite on the 12 It's mahi-mahi. It's not listed on Table menu. 13 1, and you're pregnant. 14 A PARTICIPANT: Um-hmm. 15 16 MS. HALVERSON: How would you interpret that? 17 A PARTICIPANT: I probably wouldn't get 18 19 it. MS. HALVERSON: Okay, so --20 A PARTICIPANT: Just because of the 21 uncertainty. When I was pregnant, I was just 22

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

very careful about everything like that. 1 So if it wasn't listed on the okay list --2 MS. HALVERSON: How about the rest of 3 you? Let's deal with real women here, rather 4 than our pregnant men, for a minute, here. Okay, 5 6 so the pregnant women are here. If it's not listed specifically on 7 Table 1, but it's a fish that -- what about fish 8 not on the list? It's definitely not on Table 2. 9 10 Mahi- mahi is not on Table 2. What do you say? 11 Phyllis? A PARTICIPANT: No. 12 13 MS. HALVERSON: It's our special of the 14 day. A PARTICIPANT: I know, but, you know? 15 16 I know, because if it's not on here, then it's 17 probably worse than what is on here. MS. HALVERSON: So if it's not listed 18 19 on there, you're not taking the chance? 2.0 A PARTICIPANT: NO. MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Back to our 21 pregnant men. Would you guys, how would you do 22

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

1 that? A PARTICIPANT: I'd eat it. 2 You'd eat it? MS. HALVERSON: З A PARTICIPANT: Then again, I'm not 4 (indiscernible). 5 A PARTICIPANT: 6 That's why men don't get pregnant. 7 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah. 8 9 A PARTICIPANT: It says it's okay for one meal a week. I'd probably eat it. 10 MS. HALVERSON: 11 Okav. A PARTICIPANT: But if you usually only 12 eat fish maybe twice a week anyway, you know, 13 this is one out of the two times you're going to 14 eat fish anyway. 15 16 A PARTICIPANT: Or even once a week. 17 MS. HALVERSON: He does sound like a man, doesn't he, that logic for pregnancy? Okay. 18Our third example is "Example Four," which I'm 19 going to pass out here. 20 I've never had four pregnant men in a 21 22 group before.

58

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

MS. HALVERSON: Okay. "Example Four" 1 says, "Seafood is an important and growing part 2 of the American diet. Seafood provides 3 significant nutritional benefits to consumers. 4 "Some seafood, particularly large ocean 5 fish and fresh water fish caught in contaminated 6 waters, may contain levels of mercury that pose a 7 risk to babies of pregnant and nursing mothers. 8 "The FDA and EPA advise women who are 9 pregnant, or may become pregnant within six 10 months, or are nursing mothers, to follow the 11 safe eating guidelines outlined below. 12 "This advice should not be taken as a 13 need to abstain from consuming seafood except as 14 indicated." 15 A PARTICIPANT: That's really wordy. 16 MS. HALVERSON: Wordy? Okay. 17 That sounds like they A PARTICIPANT: 18 flip flopped a little. I mean, they're, I don't 19 like the wording in that. 20 MS. HALVERSON: What do you mean flip 21flopped, Steven? 22

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

A PARTICIPANT: It's, they're saying l they realize seafood is a good part of the diet, 2 and then they jump into, yeah, we know that it's 3 a problem for nursing mothers, and then they drop 4 back, saying, oh, but by the way, we don't want 5 you to abstain from the seafood industry, because 6 they'll get pissed off at us. 7 A PARTICIPANT: When I read this, it 8 just makes me laugh --9 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah, yeah. 10 A PARTICIPANT: -- and say, this is put 11 out by the seafood industry --12 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah, right. 13 A PARTICIPANT: -- they want to sell 14 fish --15 A PARTICIPANT: Right. 16 A PARTICIPANT: -- regardless of what 17 it may do. 18 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Joanna, did you? 19 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah, it's the same 20 21 reason. MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 22

i

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

A PARTICIPANT: In this one, they don't 1 say what the risk is. In the other one, it said 2 what it causes, learning disabilities and things 3 like that, but this one doesn't say. It seems 4 like they're trying to dance around it. 5 Yeah. A PARTICIPANT: 6 A PARTICIPANT: Right. "It may contain 7 11 8 Right. 9 A PARTICIPANT: MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 10 A PARTICIPANT: "But it's an important 11growing part of the American diet." 12 A PARTICIPANT: Right. 13 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Is there any 14 important information that you think is missing 15 from this introduction? 16 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah. 17 MS. HALVERSON: What? 18 A PARTICIPANT: Exactly what the risks 19 20 are. MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 21 A PARTICIPANT: Is a big one. 22

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

MS. HALVERSON: Will this kind of 1 introduction help you understand who should be 2 paying attention to the advice? 3 4 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah. 5 MS. HALVERSON: In what way? A PARTICIPANT: In the one wordy 6 sentence there. 7 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 8 A PARTICIPANT: That was late in the --9 1.0 A PARTICIPANT: I was going to say. MS. HALVERSON: 11 Women who are pregnant 12 or may become pregnant within six months, or are nursing mothers? 13 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah, I like the, you 14 may affect your kid by eating seafood, but don't 15 take that as a need to abstain. 16 17 A PARTICIPANT: That's in the middle of the paragraph. In a paragraph, the first 18 sentence and the last sentence are the important 19 reading things. 20 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 21A PARTICIPANT: Maybe that's all one 22

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

sentence. I didn't look at it that closely. 1 A PARTICIPANT: It kind of is. If your 2 first and last would be the most important, it's 3 "Seafood is an important and growing part of the 4 American diet, " and then, "This advice should not 5 be taken as a need to abstain." 6 7 A PARTICIPANT: Right, right. MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Let's look at 8 the "As indicated" sidelines on the next page. 9 "Fish safe eating guidelines: fresh 10 water farm raised catfish or trout: there's no 11 mercury concern for these species. Ocean fish: 12 sword fish, shark, king mackerel, and tile fish: 13 no meals for women who are pregnant, women who 14 may become pregnant in the next six months, and 15 16 nursing mothers. "American favorites: canned tuna: 17 18 three- ounce serving. Up to four three-ounce servings per week for women who are pregnant, 19 women who may become pregnant in the next six 20 months, and nursing mothers. No limits for 21 others as part of a balanced diet. 22

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

"There are no limits for anyone as part 1 of a balanced diet for the following top species, 2 which make up the majority of the seafood market: 3 canned salmon, shrimp, salmon, pollock, catfish, 4 cod, clams, flounder, scallops and fish sticks. 5 "No one should eat lobster tamale." 6 What's lobster tamale? A PARTICIPANT: 7 A PARTICIPANT: I like this one best. 8 MS. HALVERSON: You like this one best 9 so far? 1.0 A PARTICIPANT: This is like the other 11 12 front page. (Simultaneous discussion.) 13 A PARTICIPANT: It gives you more tuna; 14it lets you eat all the fish you want. 15 A PARTICIPANT: Plus the highlighted 16 "No's" in this draw your attention right to the 17 concern. 18 19 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. A PARTICIPANT: It was talking about no 20 limit for all others as part of a balanced diet. 21 Does that mean all other people? 22

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

A PARTICIPANT: That's how I took it. 1 A PARTICIPANT: Or all other fish? 2 Ah, yes. MS. HALVERSON: 3 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah, I took it as 4 people. 5 A PARTICIPANT: I did too, but now I 6 7 think it's fish. A PARTICIPANT: Yeah. 8 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. What is the most 9 important point that you take from this 10 particular piece? 11 A PARTICIPANT: That sword fish, shark, 12king mackerel and tile fish are definitely 13 14 dangerous --15 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. A PARTICIPANT: -- for pregnant women, 16 or women who may become pregnant, and nursing 17 mothers. It's definitely a threat. That's what 18 19 they're saying. No meals. A PARTICIPANT: Large letters, "No 20 meals." 21 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 22

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

A PARTICIPANT: I think "Do not eat" 1 was more direct than "No meals." 2 3 A PARTICIPANT: It also --4 A PARTICIPANT: We don't use that 5 language. A PARTICIPANT: -- but it also says 6 that fresh water fish like catfish and trout are 7 fine for --8 9 A PARTICIPANT: Everybody. 10 A PARTICIPANT: -- everybody. A PARTICIPANT: 11 We're assuming. A PARTICIPANT: Yeah, the farm raised. 12 13 Not the ones you go out and catch. A PARTICIPANT: 14 Right. MS. HALVERSON: 15 So, what does it say about those, then? 16 17 A PARTICIPANT: They're very safe to eat. 18 MS. HALVERSON: About -- how about your 19 stream trout? 20 21 A PARTICIPANT: It doesn't say. A PARTICIPANT: It doesn't mention it. 22

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

MS. HALVERSON: Okay, so what would 1 your interpretation be, then, from this page? 2 A PARTICIPANT: Well, it would tell me 3 that there is probably some mercury in the trout 4 that I'm catching. 5 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 6 A PARTICIPANT: It would tell me they 7 didn't study them. 8 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 9 A PARTICIPANT: That's important to me. 10 MS. HALVERSON: What is distinctive 11 about this particular approach, compared to the 12 other two? 13 A PARTICIPANT: It doesn't have the 14 15 chart. MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 16A PARTICIPANT: Which, I don't know, to 17 me is less imposing. 18 A PARTICIPANT: I think this is easier 19 20 to understand than the second one. A PARTICIPANT: Yeah. I liked the 21 chart initially, but now that they just say, 22

ĵ,

ţ

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

"There's no mercury concern for the fresh water 1 farm raised catfish or trout, " just in general, 2 you could know that without having to see a list 3 4 of - -MS. HALVERSON: Okay, so again, I'm 5 going to ask the women to pretend we're pregnant 6 for a few minutes here. If you're reading this 7 page, and men, you don't have to be pregnant this 8 time. 9 A PARTICIPANT: Thank you humbly. 1.0 MS. HALVERSON: Okay, so all our 11 pregnant women here, what kinds of decisions do 12 Donna? we make? 13 14A PARTICIPANT: I definitely would not eat the farm raised catfish or trout, the sword 15 fish, the shark, the mackerel, or the tile fish. 16 I definitely wouldn't eat those. 17 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 18A PARTICIPANT: The others, I may once 19 in awhile, but it's not, I wouldn't be that 20 concerned about that. Maybe the reason I'm 21 saying this is, because years ago, when I was 22

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

pregnant, it wasn't such a big deal as what it is 1 nowadays, you know, with the pregnant women, and 2 it's probably because they didn't know what they 3 know now. So maybe that's my reasoning with 4 saving I would take a chance on eating some of 5 this stuff. 6 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Susan, you've 7 been pretty --8 A PARTICIPANT: This one's kind of 9 vague to me. I know what absolutely not to eat, 10 but I keep reading that last paragraph over and 11 over as to what is okay to eat, so this one to me 12 is worse. This doesn't say to me, it's okay to 13 eat this, and I can look real quick and pick it 14 So I definitely wouldn't be eating anything 15 out. off of this one. 16 17 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. And, here, let me play devil's advocate. 18 A PARTICIPANT: Okay. 19 MS. HALVERSON: Are you a meat eater? 20 A PARTICIPANT: Yes. 21 Okay, so you would beef 22 MS. HALVERSON:

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

1 or chicken?

i

2 A PARTICIPANT: Yes. 3 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. So here, I have Lynn's Fish Market, and you eat beef and chicken, 4 and you know that red meat, they say, limit your 5 intake of red meat, and don't eat the fatty parts 6 of poultry. 7 Here we've been saying fish is good for 8 you, my Omega-3 fatty acids and all, there are no 9 10 limits for anyone as part of a balance diet for the following top species, which make up the 11 majority of the seafood market. 12 13 Now, why are you going to cut out my seafood, when you're going to go ahead and eat 14 15 that other stuff? A PARTICIPANT: Well, it says there are 16 no limits. It doesn't say, this stuff is really 17 18 good for you and you should eat this. 19 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. All right. A PARTICIPANT: 20 The beef industry also 21 says there are no limits on the beef. 22 MS. HALVERSON: Okay.

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

A PARTICIPANT: And the pork industry 1 says eat pork, so -- I'm the type, I don't go 2 overboard on anything. I also don't get 3 hysterical about everything and quit eating 4 everything, because every week there's something 5 different that we're supposed to avoid. 6 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. My other 7 pregnant women here? Joanna? 8 A PARTICIPANT: I would probably cut 9 down on the amount of tuna that I consumed. 10 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Why would that 11 12be? A PARTICIPANT: I wasn't aware that it 13 had mercury in it. 14 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 15 A PARTICIPANT: It was a concern. I 16 would at least keep track of what I am eating a 17 18 week. MS. HALVERSON: Okay. How about 19 catfish, cod, clams, down here? I know catfish 20 is your favorite, right? 21 22 A PARTICIPANT: I like the catfish, and

ł

i.

i

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376 1 I like salmon.

1

2	MS. HALVERSON: Okay. So it says there
3	are no limits as part of a balanced diet.
4	A PARTICIPANT: What's the difference
5	between, I mean, is there no mercury, we're
6	assuming that there is mercury in all these
7	seafood favorites, because catfish is listed down
8	there, as opposed to up the farm raised there
9	is no mercury whatsoever, so we're assuming there
10	is mercury down in all these other favorites.
11	MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Is that the
12	assumption that you're making?
13	A PARTICIPANT: Even though it says
14	that there's no limit.
15	A PARTICIPANT: Right.
16	MS. HALVERSON: Okay. So how would
17	you, personally interpret that?
18	A PARTICIPANT: I'm interpreting it,
19	even though they're saying there's no limits, I'm
20	questioning, because there must be some mercury
21	in it if it's listed, not under, you know,
22	catfish is listed twice, so all these other fish

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

must also have some mercury, but maybe whatever 1 scale they use, it's not on the red meter. 2 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 3 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah, I have to wonder 4 why they have this paragraph down at the bottom, 5 and why the separate it from the fresh water farm б raised catfish or trout as being okay. 7 A PARTICIPANT: Well, the farm raised, 8 they can control the environment. 9 A PARTICIPANT: Right. 10 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah, what they eat. 11 12 A PARTICIPANT: But then are they saying what's down below is not as safe? That's 13 what I read. 14 (Simultaneous discussion.) 15 A PARTICIPANT: They probably don't 16 expect it to have a high mercury level but --17 A PARTICIPANT: Right. 18 A PARTICIPANT: That's why I kept 19 reading that last one over again. I'm not sure 20 21 what the message is on that one. A PARTICIPANT: That there are no 22

i

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

limits on what you eat, but --1 2 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah, but why aren't 3 there? A PARTICIPANT: Yeah. 4 5 A PARTICIPANT: If it can accumulate in your body, and if I'm just pigging out on these 6 types of fish all day long every day, will it 7 8 build up? 9 MS. HALVERSON: Well, it says, no limits as a part of a balanced diet. 10 11 A PARTICIPANT: Okav. 12 MS. HALVERSON: So how do you interpret balanced? 13 A PARTICIPANT: Eat it every day, one 14 15 meal. 16 A PARTICIPANT: Three meals a day. 17 A PARTICIPANT: Well, even just one meal a day, if you just eat fish. 18 19 MS. HALVERSON: So one meal of fish per day? 20A PARTICIPANT: 21 I mean, they're saying 22 that you shouldn't. But it would be the same as

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

if you ate chicken every day. 1 2 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. What does that last sentence mean, "No one should eat lobster 3 tamale?" 4 5 (Simultaneous discussion.) A PARTICIPANT: I think that's the --6 MS. HALVERSON: This is the first group 7 8 where nobody said, "What is lobster tamale?" (Simultaneous discussion.) 9 A PARTICIPANT: I said that. 10 A PARTICIPANT: I think I know what it 11 12 is. 13 MS. HALVERSON: Okay, Susan, you think 14 you know what it is? A PARTICIPANT: Is it like, in a crab, 15 16 you have the mustard? 17 A PARTICIPANT: I think it's that gunky 18 stuff. A PARTICIPANT: Yeah. 19 A PARTICIPANT: It's one of the 20 internal organs. It's either like the lungs, or 2122 the kidneys or something.

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

A PARTICIPANT: You're not going to get 1 2 a whole lobster at a seafood restaurant, where 3 they can eat everything. A PARTICIPANT: It's green or yellow or 4 something like that. 5 6 (Simultaneous discussion.) A PARTICIPANT: Everything on a lobster 7 is edible except for that. 8 9 A PARTICIPANT: It doesn't sound appetizing anyway. 10 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. When you look at 11 this in terms of not being a pregnant woman, what 12kinds of decisions do you make for your own 13 balanced diet? 14 15 A PARTICIPANT: If you're not pregnant? MS. HALVERSON: Um-hmm. 16 A PARTICIPANT: I still think if 17 18 there's a danger to pregnant women, there's got to be a danger to the average person. 19 20 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 21 A PARTICIPANT: There's just got to be. 22 A PARTICIPANT: My question is, if

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

you've got to eat it, if you're going to be 1 2 pregnant in the next six months, you have to eliminate it or control it, why would you have to 3 control it, if it's six months before you're 4 pregnant or something? 5 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah, so it does stay б in your body. 7 A PARTICIPANT: If it's building up in 8 her body, why isn't it building up in his or 9 somebody else's body? 10 A PARTICIPANT: That's because all you 11 12 men are stupid because you've been eating so much 13 fish. MS. HALVERSON: Okay. I would like to 14go back to the first one that I gave you, which 15 is "Example Five" and just look at, just briefly 16 review this again, the first paragraph, and then 17 the chart. 18 Then somebody explain for me in plain 19 English, we're going to try to distinguish among 20 these three. Explain for me in the plainest 21 English what "Example Five" is saying, the 22

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

distinctive message of "Example Five." 1 A PARTICIPANT: Mackerel, shark and 2 sword fish pose a high threat. 3 MS. HALVERSON: Mackerel, shark and 4 sword fish pose a high threat --5 6 A PARTICIPANT: To pregnant women. 7 MS. HALVERSON: -- to pregnant women? A PARTICIPANT: Or nursing. 8 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Anyone else have 9 10 a different capsule interpretation of this one? A PARTICIPANT: Well, it says it's a 11 12 high source --(Tape change.) 13 MS. HALVERSON: -- fish is an important 14 15 source of protein, vitamins and minerals, but 16 there's danger involved. A PARTICIPANT: Yeah, to prequant women 17 or nursing mothers. 18 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. And then you 19 would limit the three fish, Phyllis? 20 A PARTICIPANT: I would say, I would 21 22 probably categorize it these three are

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

particularly suspect, and then go into the tuna 1 2 and the others, that they are less suspect. MS. HALVERSON: Okay. How would, less 3 4 suspect? A PARTICIPANT: Than the mackerel, 5 shark and sword fish. б MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Any other 7 capsule interpretations of this "Example Five?" 8 A PARTICIPANT: This still just makes 9 me real curious as to why not? 10 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Why not those 11 12 three fish? A PARTICIPANT: Um-hmm. 13 MS. HALVERSON: What is it about these 14 three fish? 15A PARTICIPANT: And then the 16 highlighted heavy black lettering on this just, 17 you look at that and you go, I mean, why? 18 A PARTICIPANT: Why not? 19 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah, what are they 2021 actually trying to tell me here? What did that mackerel eat yesterday that I'm not supposed to? 22

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

1 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Let's look at 2 "Example Three" again, and do the same thing, kind of a one or two sentence summary. 3 A PARTICIPANT: Too wordy. 4 A PARTICIPANT: But I still do like 5 6 them saying, a report from the National Academy of Sciences. 7 MS. HALVERSON: 8 Okay. A PARTICIPANT: Even though it says 9 "looked at the evidence," my personal feeling is, 10 I would tend to believe it because of that more 11 12 so than "Example Five." 13 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. A PARTICIPANT: It has more 14 15 credibility. 16 A PARTICIPANT: Right. A PARTICIPANT: It has a lot more 17 18 credibility, just because of --19A PARTICIPANT: And I like that they said why. Isn't this the one where they said it 20 will cause learning disabilities? 21 A PARTICIPANT: I like this one the 22

best. I think it needs to be worded more to the 1 2 general public, but I like all the information 3 the best. MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 4 A PARTICIPANT: It's less threatening, 5 almost, knowing exactly what it does, than б letting my brain wander, and think of all these 7 horrible things that this lead could possibly do. 8 I like knowing. That's not so horrible. Okay, 9 now I know, there will be learning problems, and 10 11 \_\_\_\_ A PARTICIPANT: This is how I can 12 avoid --13 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah. 14 A PARTICIPANT: I'm an old person and I 15 don't care how stupid I get. I'll eat this. 16 MS. HALVERSON: So if you were going to 17 summarize "Example Three" in one or two 18 sentences, it would be, in plain English for 19 20 me --21 A PARTICIPANT: Don't eat fish. 22 A PARTICIPANT: Mercury can cause

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

learning problems in children. 1 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 2 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah, I'd say if you 3 were of that age, or pregnant, just to steer 4 clear of it, and get your supplements in some 5 6 other way. A PARTICIPANT: Yeah. 7 Sorry, I didn't hear 8 MS. HALVERSON: 9 that last part. A PARTICIPANT: Get the supplements 10 some other way. 11 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 12 A PARTICIPANT: I would say there are 1.3risks involved, but as it is a part of a good 14balanced diet, you don't need to avoid it 15altogether, that there are fish that you can 16 safely consume once in awhile. 17 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 18 A PARTICIPANT: I think all three of 19 them should address other people than --20 A PARTICIPANT: Pregnant mothers. 21 A PARTICIPANT: -- pregnant mothers, 22

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

nursing mothers. Like men and then older women,
 or children.

A PARTICIPANT: Maybe this is from the 3 TV actors association or something. 4 A PARTICIPANT: They could still make a 5 note of it. They'll have the information. 6 7 MS. HALVERSON: Okay, let's look again at the last one, "Example Four" and again, I have 8 a real simple mind, so bring it down to one or 9 two clear, plain English sentences for me. 10 A PARTICIPANT: I think it says a lot 11 of Americans enjoy seafood, that they should be 12 careful, because there are some dangers. 13 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Any other 14 15 interpretation there? 16 A PARTICIPANT: I think it's just what I initially said, that it's good but there's a 17 risk. 18 MS. HALVERSON: 19 Okay. 2.0A PARTICIPANT: You know, it's good for you but there's a risk. 21A PARTICIPANT: Anything in excess is 22

1 too much.

i

1----

2	MS. HALVERSON: Okay. I'm going to go
3	to the board, and given everything that we've
4	been talking about tonight, let's just try and
5	figure out, when they come up, I heard you say
6	things you do and don't like about all of these.
7	If you guys were developing a message,
8	what are the kinds of things you would include in
9	it?
10	A PARTICIPANT: A chart.
11	MS. HALVERSON: A chart. Of?
12	A PARTICIPANT: Of best to worst.
13	MS. HALVERSON: Okay.
14	A PARTICIPANT: I would have one chart,
15	just alphabetical, so you could find whatever you
16	wanted real quick, and then next to it, "Don't
17	eat," "Unlimited quantities," or "Moderation."
18	MS. HALVERSON: Okay.
19	A PARTICIPANT: That would be simple.
20	A PARTICIPANT: That would be, wouldn't
21	it?
22	MS. HALVERSON: Okay, and in terms of

2 everyone?
3 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah.
4 A PARTICIPANT: Everyone.

who it should address. Pregnant women, or

A PARTICIPANT: I think everyone.
MS. HALVERSON: Everyone?
A PARTICIPANT: Yeah, it should speak

8 to everyone.

1

9 A PARTICIPANT: Including young kids 10 who aren't nursing anymore. Does it affect them? 11 A PARTICIPANT: I'd like to see why 12 mercury was a problem.

MS. HALVERSON: Anything else?
A PARTICIPANT: It was nice when it had
some credibility to it.

MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Which -- they mentioned National Academy of Sciences --

18 A PARTICIPANT: FDA.

19 A PARTICIPANT: EPA.

20 MS. HALVERSON: Okay, so include all

21 three of those?

22 A PARTICIPANT: It would support the

1

research more, probably.

2 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah. 3 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Anything else that we'll definitely include, or clarify? 4 A PARTICIPANT: I think, it's probably 5 just me, but I would like more information on 6 7 what problems it causes. MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 8 A PARTICIPANT: With memory retention 9 in kids --10 11 A PARTICIPANT: Well, yeah, that's 12 because they're pregnant. If it's adults, you don't know it's going to affect adults. 13 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 14 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah. And the younger 15 16 children, school age children. 17 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. And then in terms of the information, you wanted a chart of 18 19 some kind? A PARTICIPANT: I still think that's 20 easiest to read. 21 22 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah, I think so.

MS. HALVERSON: 1 Okay. I like a chart. 2 A PARTICIPANT: MS. HALVERSON: I heard some of you 3 4 saying, I want the chart to list for me the 5 things that I can eat as a pregnant woman, as well as the "don't eat" and I hear others saying, 6 7 just tell me what I can't eat. Is that correct? 8 A PARTICIPANT: I think I have to 9 agree. I think to see them both would be nice. 10 I'd like to know what I could eat, and it 11 wouldn't hurt to know what you can't eat. 1213 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 14A PARTICIPANT: Yeah, I'd rather not have anything questionable. You see it on a 15 16 chart, you'd know for sure. MS. HALVERSON: 17 Okay. A PARTICIPANT: And maybe without it 18 getting too wordy, just if it's written in a 19 20 percentage type form or something, just how much 21 is too much. 22 MS. HALVERSON: Okay.

87

A PARTICIPANT: Or we can even have the 1 2 chart, again, in alphabetical order, and the ones that have the names in red, you can't eat. 3 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah, having those 4 stand out a little bit more. 5 A PARTICIPANT: Wouldn't your doctor 6 tell you, if you're pregnant, if you shouldn't 7 eat some things, maybe? 8 9 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. A PARTICIPANT: That depends on the 10 11 doctor. Some will give you a book and tell you 12 to read it yourself. 13 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Anything they should avoid in terms of format or wording or 14 15 anything else? I heard a number of comments. 16 A PARTICIPANT: Not too wordy. 17 A PARTICIPANT: Right. Not run on 18 sentences. A PARTICIPANT: Yeah. 19 20 A PARTICIPANT: Not to put people down, but so often, pregnant people are very young 21 22 teenage girls, and they aren't going to read that

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

1 whole thing.

2 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Short sentences. 3 A PARTICIPANT: To the point. A PARTICIPANT: And to the point, 4 right. 5 6 A PARTICIPANT: When I did technical writing for a manufacturer, it had to be seventh 7 8 grade. MS. HALVERSON: Okay. 9 A PARTICIPANT: You know they've 10 lowered that to sixth grade now? 11 12 A PARTICIPANT: Oh no. 13 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. Any other advice 14 that you would give? A PARTICIPANT: I didn't like the last 15 16 one where it said, seafood is a growing part of -- it's like they are trying to tell me. 17 18 Maybe to some people it's not important. A PARTICIPANT: Like they're trying to 19 convince you. 20 A PARTICIPANT: Like they're trying to 21 convince me. 22

A PARTICIPANT: Yeah, I don't like 1 that. Don't try to sell me fish. 2 A PARTICIPANT: Right. 3 A PARTICIPANT: And I think when we 4 were talking, too, we keep going just to seafood, 5 but we were talking fresh water fish, too. I'd 6 like to see some fresh water fish. 7 A PARTICIPANT: That list had good 8 information on the last one. It said fresh water 9 farm raised catfish or trout, that were 1.0 concerned. 11 MS. HALVERSON: But look out for the 12 Mike's of the world who are out there catching 13 their own. 14 A PARTICIPANT: I love trout. 15 A PARTICIPANT: I do read a lot of soil 16 and water studies, too. I try to know what's 17 upstream from where I'm fishing, if it's a gold 18 mine, or if I'm going to be catching heavily 19 polluted fish or not. 20 MS. HALVERSON: So the stuff you're 21 going to serve us is good, right? 22

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

A PARTICIPANT: Yep. It's great. 1 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. I'd like to ask 2 you to pass around "Example Three," then "Example 3 Four," then "Example Five," and I'm going to run 4 next door and see if there are some questions 5 that I should ask that I haven't asked yet, okay? 6 I'll be right back. 7 (Moderator leaves the room.) 8 A PARTICIPANT: Three? 9 A PARTICIPANT: Three. 10 A PARTICIPANT: Four. 11 12 A PARTICIPANT: Three, four, five. A PARTICIPANT: Here's some fours. 13 (Moderator returns.) 14 MS. HALVERSON: Great. 15 A PARTICIPANT: You found out what 16 lobster tamale is. 17 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah. 18 MS. HALVERSON: I think it is that 19 20 gunk. A PARTICIPANT: We can eat it, because 21 22 we're not pregnant.

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

MS. HALVERSON: I think it said 1 everyone should avoid lobster tamale. Sorry. 2 A PARTICIPANT: Yeah. 3 A PARTICIPANT: I wouldn't eat it 4 5 anyway. A PARTICIPANT: I probably have eaten 6 it and don't even know it. 7 MS. HALVERSON: Okay. They don't have 8 9 any more questions for us, so I want to thank you all for being here this evening. If you head out 10 to the front, I think Betty has something for you 11 12there. So thank you very much for coming. A PARTICIPANT: Thank you. 13 (Whereupon the taping was concluded.) 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

l	CERTIFICATE OF TRANSCRIBER
2	I, Helen M. Collins, Tape
3	Transcriptionist, do hereby certify that the
4	foregoing pages are a true and accurate
5	transcription, made by me to the best of my
6	ability, from a copy of a tape recording of
7	Macro, Methyl Mércury, Denver, October 17, 2000,
8	8:00 p.m.; that any inaudible or unintelligible
9	tape segments are parenthetically indicated
10	within the body of the transcript; that the
11	proper designations of speakers were not always
12	clear from the recording; and that I am neither
13	counsel for, related to, nor employed by any of
14	the parties to the action in which this
15	proceeding took place; and, further, that I am
16	not a relative or employee of any attorney or
17	counsel employed by the parties thereto, nor
18	financially or otherwise interested in the
19	outcome of the action.

20

ł

1

21

22

-

ellin > Helen

HELEN M. COLLINS, Transcriber

Word-for-Word Reporters & Transcribers \*\*\* Nationwide/24-Hours (301) 431-3900 & (202) 775-1842 & (888) 752-3376

.